

**CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
REGULAR PLANNING COMMISSION
March 9, 2022
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING**

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Jessica Cohen	Chair
	Michael Gaynier	Vice Chair
	Leonard Horowitz	
	Jessica Wobig	

STAFF PRESENT:	Eric Zamft	Planning Director
	Karen Knittel	Assistant Planning Director
	Lee Crumrine	Assistant Director of Law
	Christy Lee	Recording Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Cohen called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. She welcomed the audience to the March 9, 2022 Regular Webex meeting of the Cleveland Heights Planning Commission.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Ms. Cohen stated that the minutes from the previous meeting will be available next due next month. Ms. Cohen then made the Planning Commission that they would now proceed with the Election of Officers.

Ms. Cohen requested nomination for Chair of the Planning Commission.

Leonard Horowitz nominated Jessica Cohen for Chair of the Planning Commission.

Michael Gaynier made a motion to close the nomination.

Jessica Wobig seconded the motion.

Approved 4-0.

Ms. Cohen stated they would now vote on the nomination for Chair of the Planning Commission.

The motion was approved 4-0 for Jessica Cohen to remain Chair of the Planning Commission for an additional term.

Ms. Cohen asked for nomination for Vice-Chair of the Planning Commission.

Ms. Cohen nominated Michael Gaynier for Vice-Chair of the Planning Commission.

MS. Wobig made a motion to close the nomination.
Leonard Horowitz seconded the motion.

Approved 4-0.

Ms. Cohen stated they would now vote on the nomination for Vice-Chair of the Planning Commission.

The motion was approved 4-0 for Michael Gaynier to remain Vice-Chair of the Planning Commission for an additional term.

Lee Crumrine swore in staff.

Karen Knittel's PowerPoint Presentation was as followed:

Proj. No. 22-03 Beaumont School, 3301 North Park Blvd., AA Single-Family requests a change to conditional use permit to replace the current track and field with a regulation-sized soccer/lacrosse field with softball backstop, fencing, and bleachers.

CONTEXT

The school is located on the former Painter Estate between North Park and Fairmount Boulevards and Lee and Shelburne Roads. It is in an "AA" Single-Family District, with the Ruffing Montessori School and single-family homes in the "AA" Single-Family district to the east, the former Carmelite Monastery site to the west, and homes in an "A" Single-Family district along Fairmount Boulevard to the north, and Shaker Lakes Park to the south.

The entire Beaumont campus is a designated Cleveland Heights Landmark. Structures that still exist from the original estate include the Painter mansion, outbuildings along Fairmount Boulevard, and a carriage house (17412 Shelburne, part of the Ruffing Montessori School campus), and a stone wall that surrounds much of the block described in the previous paragraph.

HISTORY

Over the years, Ursuline Academy of Cleveland/Beaumont School for Girls has been granted conditional use permits and variances for various improvements to the property including a master plan, building additions, athletic facilities, signage, and parking. In 2019, a request to demolish the Painter mansion to establish additional athletic fields was denied.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The Beaumont School proposes to replace the existing track and soccer field with an Ohio High School Athletic Association (OHSAA) regulation-sized soccer and lacrosse field. The soccer/lacrosse field is mostly in the same footprint as the current field and will include the area taken up by the track in order to meet the size regulation. The Applicant has indicated that it will arrange to have track practice and events at another location. Staff recommends that the Planning Commission asked the Applicant how practice and events that had been held on the track will be managed.

The field would include a softball backstop, fencing, and bleachers. The proposed fencing requires a height variance to permit fences taller than 4 feet in the front yard along North Park Blvd. and to permit the fence to be black poly-coated chain-link as chain link is not a permitted fence material for front yards. The backstop will be four, 14-foot tall posts that will have netting hosted in place only during use. The bleachers would seat 316 spectators including six (6) handicap spaces. The existing scoreboard will remain and be painted. There are no plans to light the field.

The new soccer/lacrosse field would be used by the School for physical education classes, lacrosse practices and games and soccer practices and games, and the occasional softball practices. In the summer, the summer camp may use it.

REQUEST FOR REVISION OF CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

The Beaumont campus is a conditionally permitted use in this residentially zoned district. Any change to a conditional use requires a new conditional use permit.

STANDARDS FOR CONDITIONAL USES

A conditional use, and uses accessory to such conditional use, shall be permitted in a residential, commercial or special district only when specified as a permitted conditional use in such district, or when such use is determined by the Planning Commission to be a similar use, and only if such use conforms to the following standards in addition to any specific conditions, standards and regulations for such category of use set forth in Chapter 1151 of the Zoning Code. Furthermore, the Planning Commission shall find:

- a) *That the conditional use will be in general accord with the purpose, intent and basic planning objectives of this Zoning Code, and with the objectives for the district in which located – A school in an "AA" Single-Family district is in keeping with the intent of the Zoning Code. Renovating the existing track and field to a regulation-sized soccer/lacrosse field maintains the site's current campus conditions while enabling the students to participate in athletic games on their campus.*
- b) *That the establishment, maintenance or operation of the conditional use will not be detrimental to or endanger the public health, safety, morals, comfort or general welfare – The updating of the field should have no negative effect on the public welfare.*
- c) *That the conditional use will be designed, constructed, operated and maintained so as to be harmonious and appropriate in appearance with the existing or intended character of the general vicinity, and that such use will not essentially change the character of the same area – The proposed renovation to the athletic field is in the same location as the current track and soccer field and maintains the existing character of the area. The Applicant does not anticipate increased volumes of traffic that would result in a negative impact on nearby residential properties.*
- d) *That the conditional use will not be injurious to the use and enjoyment of other property in the immediate vicinity for the purposes already permitted, nor substantially diminish and impair property values within the neighborhood – The upgrading of the soccer/lacrosse field should not impact the neighborhood. The applicant estimates that the largest crowds from past events were about 175 to 200 persons. The estimate is that the largest crowds at the new field would be between 200 and 300 persons. This would be similar to other school-sponsored events held on the campus. There is parking available on the school campus. However, should parking become a concern, the conversion of the school's land-banked parking could be reviewed. There are no plans to light the field.*
- e) *That the establishment of the conditional use will not impede the normal and orderly development and improvement of the surrounding property for uses permitted in the district – Surrounding properties should not be impeded by the renovated field.*
- f) *That adequate utilities, access roads, drainage and/or necessary facilities have been or are being provided – Public utilities should not be impacted. The field's stormwater drainage will be reworked as part of this project. The stormwater plans will be reviewed by the Director of Public Works for compliance with the City's stormwater regulations contained in Chapter 1335 Stormwater Management.*
- g) *That adequate measures have been or will be taken to provide ingress and egress designed as to minimize traffic congestion in the public streets – Parking is available on the school's property with access to parking areas from North Park Blvd. and Fairmount Blvd.*

- h) *That the establishment of the conditional use should not be detrimental to the economic welfare of the community by creating excessive additional requirements at public cost for public facilities such as police, fire and schools – No impact on City services is anticipated.*
- i) *That there is minimal potential for future hardship on the conditional use that could result from the proposed use being surrounded by uses permitted by right that are incompatible – No future hardship is foreseen.*
- j) *That the conditional use shall address the sustainability guidelines of Section 1165.06 – see below.*
- k) *That the conditional use shall, in all other respects, conform to the applicable regulations of the district in which it is located as well as the specific supplemental conditions set forth in Chapter 1153.- see below.*

SUPPLEMENTAL STANDARDS FOR THIS CONDITIONAL USE (Chapter 1153)

This is an existing school campus and the use complies with the standards for schools.

Section 1153.05 allows the Planning Commission to require a school to fence in an outdoor play area to minimize traffic hazards and buffer neighborhoods. The applicant proposes fencing and a backstop along North Park Boulevard as part of the athletic field upgrade.

SUSTAINABILITY GUIDELINES (Sect. 1165.06)

The following design characteristics and amenities are provided as a non-exclusive guide of items to be considered for all development plans. Additional design characteristics and public benefits and amenities not listed may also be considered.

- 1) *Historic preservation and adaptive reuse of existing structures.*
- 2) *The use of sustainable design and architecture, such as the use and/or incorporation of green roofs or white roofs, solar panels, wind turbines and other alternative energy-efficient systems, and LEED (Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design) or LEED-equivalent structures.*
- 3) *Incorporation of passive solar building and site design, where the design of the structure and the layout of the lots within the development collect solar energy in the form of heat in the winter and minimize heat in the summer.*
- 4) *Where the development requires the demolition of existing structures, recycling and reuse of building materials from demolished structures.*
- 5) *Site design that incorporates public safety initiatives, such as strategies advocated by Transportation Demand Management, Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) and Safe Routes to School.*
- 6) *Preservation of natural features where the design of the site provides more usable and suitably located open space and natural amenities. The use of conservation easements is encouraged.*
- 7) *Innovative storm water management techniques that exceed the performance standards required by the Ordinance and the City Code, and reduce the amount of impervious surface on the site.*
- 8) *Additional public infrastructure improvements in addition to the minimum required by the planned development overlay, such as new or repaved streets, provision of bicycle paths, installation of gutters and sewers, new public transit stations, and traffic control devices to improve traffic flow.*
- 9) *Community amenities such as public art, places to congregate such as plazas, malls, gardens, outdoor seating, and pedestrian and transit facilities.*
- 10) *Additional open space and recreational amenities such as recreational open space and playgrounds, including athletic fields, dog parks, and natural water features and conservation areas above that required by the Ordinance.*
- 11) *Provision of car or bicycle sharing facilities on-site.*

SUSTAINABILITY GUIDELINES COMMENTARY (Sect. 1165.06)

Most of the sustainability guidelines are not pertinent to this application. Placing the regulation soccer/lacrosse field in the same location as the current track and soccer field enable the balance of the campus, including the open space to remain as is. The project scope includes reworking the existing stormwater drainage for the new field. The final stormwater plan will be reviewed and approved by the City's Public Works Director per Code Chapter 1335 Stormwater Management.

The eight-foot fence will be installed between the field and the trees along North Park Boulevard. The applicant intends to preserve these trees and does not anticipate any tree removal to install the fence. If during installation it is discovered that there would be an impact to any trees, this should be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator and this should be a condition of approval.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve the revised conditional use permit for the soccer/lacrosse field as described in the Planning Commission application with the following additional conditions:

1. Approval of the Architectural Board of Review;
2. Approval of the Landmark Commission;
3. Receipt of all required variances from the Board of Zoning Appeals;
4. Fencing shall be installed to preserve the trees along North Park Blvd. with the Zoning Administrator's review and approval required for any tree removal;
5. The 14-foot tall poles shall only be used for the intended purpose of having the backstop netting held in place during use;
6. Receipt of all other required local approvals and permits;
7. This use shall not be injurious to the use and enjoyment of other properties in the immediate vicinity or create a nuisance for adjacent properties;
8. The Applicant shall work with staff to resolve any complaints from neighbors; and
9. All required construction and installation of the use shall be completed within 24 months of Planning Commission approval.

Ms. Cohen asked about the possible lengthening of the completion term to be greater than 24 months.

Ms. Knittel stated that the amount of time needed can be verified by the applicate this evening.

Ms. Cohen asked if there were any other questions for Ms. Knittel. There were none.

Lee Crumrine swore in the Beaumont School representative.

Beaumont representative gave a PowerPoint presentation further detailing the proposed project. He further explained that the current field/track was not of regulation size and therefore was the reason for the needed change along with adding artificial turf to the field. He went on to explain the portal bleacher would be replaced with permanent bleachers. He also indicated that they would install a soccer net that would help decrease the number of soccer balls entering the wooded around surrounding the field.

Ms. Cohen asked if there were any questions at this time for the Beaumont Reprehensive.

Ms. Wobig asked for clarification on the image of the new fencing that would be installed and was there currently a fence at the site.

Beaumont Representative responded that it is similar to that image, still a 4-foot-high chain-linked fence with black poly coating and yes this would be a new fence.

Ms. Cohen asked if they were comfortable with the 24-month condition on completion of this project.

Beaumont representative responded that they were comfortable with this time frame.

Ms. Wobig asked a question of the Planning Staff on how the field would host games considering it is currently not being used.

Beaumont representative that it is currently not being used. He stated that all of the track meets need to be off-site and most of the soccer games as well.

Michael Gaynier asked if there has been any communication with the surrounding neighbors regarding this project.

Susan Frankel responded that they did hold a community meeting so that the surrounding neighbors were made aware of the changes and improvements to the field. She added that there was a letter submitted by a neighbor that was submitted to the Planning Commission showing their support of the project.

Ms. Cohen asked if there was a motion to approve Proj. No. 22-03 Beaumont School.

Michael Gaynier made a motion to approve Proj. No. 22-03 Beaumont School, 3301 North Park Blvd., AA Single-Family requests a change to conditional use permit to replace the current track and field with a regulation-sized soccer/lacrosse field with softball backstop, fencing, and bleachers with following staff recommendations:

1. Approval of the Architectural Board of Review;
2. Approval of the Landmark Commission;
3. Receipt of all required variances from the Board of Zoning Appeals;
4. Fencing shall be installed to preserve the trees along North Park Blvd. with Zoning Administrator review and approval required for any tree removal;
5. The 14-foot tall poles shall only be used for the intended purpose of having the backstop netting held in place during use;
6. Receipt of all other required local approvals and permits;
7. This use shall not be injurious to the use and enjoyment of other properties in the immediate vicinity or create a nuisance for adjacent properties;
8. The Applicant shall work with staff to resolve any complaints from neighbors; and
9. All required construction and installation of the use shall be completed within 24 months of Planning Commission approval.

Leonard Horowitz second the motion.

Motion approved 4-0.

Eric Zamft updated the Planning Commission the appointing of Adam to the Planning Commission by Council and that they are diligently working to fill the two remaining openings on the Planning Commission. Mr. Zamft added that when those spots have been filled that Planning Commission will continue with training. Mr. Zamft went to update the Commission regard Cedar Lee-Meadowbrook, they will soon have the completed traffic/parking study for review. Mr. Zamft made the Planning Commission aware of the new policy on delivering of Planning Packages going forward and that soon all packages would be sent in a PDF form.

Ms. Cohen state she is for stainability, however considering that the Planning Commission often receives site plans, receiving them in a PDF form would make them somewhat difficult to review. Ms. Cohen asked will the process start effective immediately and will there be a meeting for next month.

Ms. Knittel stated that there would be a meeting next month and that the packets will be available for pick up on the Friday before the meeting.

Ms. Cohen reminded the Planning Commission members that their bio's needed to be submitted to Mr. Zamft as soon as possible so that they can be place on the City of Cleveland Heights web site.

Michael Gaynier asked if there was an update on if or when the meeting would resume to in person meetings at City Hall.


Mr. Zamft stated that while the State of Ohio governor gave the ability for all Boards and Commissions to continue to meet virtually through June of 2022, however it's under the overview of the Board or Commission.

Ms. Cohen thanked Mr. Gaynier for bring this up and they will take this under consideration as group on what would best for the Commission.

Leonard Horowitz asked for clarification on the Cedar Lee Meadowbrook and building plan and landscape plan and have there been any changes at this time.
Mr. Zamft stated that they are still working on the building and landscape plan at this time.

The meeting adjourned at 7:38pm



Jessica Cohen, Chair

Eric Zamft, Secretary

